Reimagining the Rural West Initiative

The Chairman’s Initiative of North Dakota Governor Doug Burgum

2020
Dear Friends and Colleagues,

The West is home to wide-open spaces and thriving world-class cities. You cannot separate the rural West, with its people, culture, and communities, from the prosperity of the West as whole. As the population of the West concentrates in metropolitan areas, rural communities – including tribal communities – face increasing challenges to provide the services, infrastructure and opportunities needed to thrive. At the same time, we are in a moment of historic transformation in our economy. Opportunity abounds in rural areas in response to global economic trends and technological innovation. Many rural communities have capitalized on these new opportunities and are thriving, but many others are still adapting or preparing for significant change.

How do we re-energize those less successful communities and help them tap into an increasingly technological world? That was the question the Western Governors sought to answer when we launched the Reimagining the Rural West Initiative last July. The Initiative has since examined challenges and highlighted opportunities in rural economic development, infrastructure and quality of life organized around three major pillars:

- **Opportunity:** Creating an environment in which everyone has the chance to prosper, whether as a first-time entrepreneur, seasoned business owner, recent graduate starting a career or a midcareer worker looking to learn new skills.

- **Connectivity:** Ensuring that rural communities are connected, by high-speed internet and safe, efficient transportation networks, so that people in the rural West can plug into the global economy and take advantage of cutting-edge technology.

- **Community:** Supporting community-led efforts to solve local challenges and building smart, healthy, vibrant communities.

The Initiative sought answers through several avenues, starting with regional workshops. The events attracted leading experts on rural development. Kicking off at a workshop in Fargo, North Dakota, rural sociologist Ben Winchester set the stage for the Initiative by inviting us to reject the popular narrative that rural communities are dying and explaining the trends shaping small towns today. An impressive array of experts subsequently explored topics such as innovation in agriculture, forestry and energy, the growing impact of tourism and outdoor recreation, the future of remote work, benefits of the arts and culture, and how to engage young people in shaping their communities’ future.

Other workshops were hosted by fellow Western Governors, New Mexico’s Michelle Lujan Grisham, Idaho’s Brad Little and Oregon’s Kate Brown. These workshops illustrated the diversity of the West’s rural communities as well as the commonalities we all share. When the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic became clear, WGA swiftly launched a webinar series that explored what it meant for the communities at the heart of the Initiative’s work.

Out of this extensive work, WGA has developed a special report on the Initiative that shares best practices and policy recommendations to support vibrant rural communities in the West. Highlights include:

- **Change the way we do economic development to focus on attracting workforce and building community assets that improve quality of life.**

- **Develop policy and financial solutions that can bring broadband access to all rural communities, enabling them to take advantage of remote work opportunities, distance learning and telehealth, among other things.**

- **Strengthen local leadership with the capacity to develop a shared vision for the future along with their community, and then leverage local resources to achieve it.**

While it is not yet clear how long-lasting the impacts of the pandemic will be, it is certain that rural communities are facing additional challenges and strains as a result. The pandemic is also illuminating some of the advantages and opportunities rural communities offer, particularly as more Americans adopt new distance approaches in work, school and health care, and pursue less dense living, vacation and recreation alternatives – all of which make urgent the findings and recommendations found in this report.

We extend our gratitude to our state and federal partners, especially the U.S. Department of Agriculture, as well as to our many sponsors, for all their hard work and investments. We also appreciate the support of the U.S. Department of Labor, Office of Disability Employment Policy’s State Exchange on Employment & Disability. We look forward to collaborating with them and the Western Governors on the recommendations in this report.

With warmest regards,

Doug Burgum,
Governor, State of North Dakota
In undertaking Reimagining the Rural West, North Dakota Governor Doug Burgum has pursued one of the more ambitious WGA Chair Initiatives in memory. Built around the pillars of Opportunity, Connectivity and Community, the Initiative has produced a trenchant examination of challenges and opportunities in economic development, infrastructure and quality of life in the rural West.

At the time of the Initiative’s launch in the summer of 2019, the country was enjoying a period of great economic prosperity. The West was booming, with especially low unemployment rates and favorable conditions for investment and new job creation. A principal objective of the Initiative was to determine how Governors could help rural communities thrive and participate more fully in a growing global economy.

And then COVID-19 hit.

The world and its economy were turned upside down. Because rural residents are, on average, older than their urban brethren, rural communities had heightened vulnerabilities to the disease. Because of hospital closures and severe shortages of medical personnel, many rural areas were not equipped to meet the emergent demands of a viral public health crisis. Because of gaps in broadband coverage, many rural communities were deprived of the telehealth, distance learning and remote work opportunities available to others during this period.

The focus of the Initiative shifted from how to help rural communities thrive in a time of prosperity to how to help them survive in a time of crisis.

Pivoting from in-person workshops to virtual meeting formats, WGA assembled industry professionals, academic experts, elected officials and other thought leaders for a broad analysis of COVID-19’s impacts on rural communities. In the course of producing a record number of Initiative webinars, the Association examined such critical issues as rural economic mitigation, broadband deployment, emergency healthcare delivery and cybersecurity challenges, to name a few. I commend your attention to the online appendix accompanying this report, which represents a comprehensive record of stakeholder input to the effort. Also, I encourage you to listen to the podcast series about Reimagining the Rural West that was produced for Out West, the official podcast of WGA.

Throughout the turmoil and disquietude of the past few months, Western Governors have remained singularly focused on the wellbeing of their constituents. I am confident that the policy products of Reimagining the Rural West will represent a meaningful contribution to their efforts in this regard. The Initiative’s findings and recommendations will inform gubernatorial policy and WGA’s work in rural prosperity for years to come.

Respectfully,

Jim Ogsbury
WGA Executive Director
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

North Dakota Governor Doug Burgum, Chair of the Western Governors’ Association, launched Reimagining the Rural West in July 2019 to strengthen rural communities across the West. Rural communities face substantial challenges, but trends and technological innovations in recent years have also presented enormous opportunity. The Initiative leveraged the expertise and experience of rural stakeholders to help Western Governors support vibrant and prosperous rural communities.

Reimagining the Rural West began with surveys and stakeholder outreach to identify the most pressing challenges and promising opportunities facing rural communities. Respondents from across the West helped to focus the initiative on three pillars: Opportunity, Connectivity, and Community.

The Initiative subsequently convened a workshop and webinar series to explore these topics in depth. Workshops were hosted by Western Governors Doug Burgum in North Dakota, Michelle Lujan Grisham in New Mexico, Brad Little in Idaho and Kate Brown in a virtual workshop after the COVID-19 pandemic precluded gathering in Oregon. Workshops and webinars assembled local leaders, state policymakers, federal partners, community development organizations, business leaders, and rural experts to share best practices and discuss policy recommendations. After the emergence of the COVID-19 public health crisis, the Initiative shifted its focus to the impacts of the pandemic on rural communities and held several webinars on response and recovery.

This report presents the Initiative’s findings and recommendations to strengthen rural communities using the three thematic pillars:

Opportunity: Economic development in the rural West should strive to create an environment in which everyone – new entrepreneurs, seasoned business owners, recent graduates starting a career, and midcareer workers pursuing new skills – has the chance to succeed and prosper.

• Increase flexibility of economic development funds to include investments in community assets that improve quality of life. Development programs that focus on quality of life help build rural communities that are desirable places to live and work. Such programs also promote business development and draw new residents while protecting the community’s rural character.

• Create an environment in which businesses, entrepreneurs and remote workers prosper. Fostering a stable and diverse base of small businesses and location-neutral jobs increases resiliency and provides more and varied opportunities for innovation and growth.

• Educate and train rural citizens for the jobs available in their communities. A nimble and responsive workforce development system that integrates K-12 education, post-secondary education, and regional employers is needed to keep pace with economic change.

Connectivity: Improve the quality of connectivity in rural areas, including broadband and transportation networks, so that rural communities can access essential goods and services, plug into the global economy, and enjoy the myriad benefits that ease of connection provides.

• Increase and improve broadband connectivity. Improvements in mapping, better coordination in deployment, and increased investment are all needed to expand connectivity in the rural West.

• Improve the quality of transportation connectivity. Good transportation...
networks are essential to rural quality of life, connecting residents to jobs, educational opportunities, health care and social services that may be unavailable in their immediate community. In the West, where rural areas are vast and communities are separated by rugged terrain, air service is a necessity.

**Community:** Deliver the tools and resources to enable rural communities to provide residents with basic needs such as clean water, housing and food security. Empower local decisionmakers in the development and implementation of their own vision for the future.

- **Strengthen local leadership and capacity.** More funding, and more consistent funding, is needed for institutions, training, and technical assistance to help communities comprehensively address development needs and conduct post-disaster recovery work.

- **Improve the efficacy of federal and state programs to support critical infrastructure in the rural West.** Rural applicants must navigate a complex bureaucracy of federal and state programs to access the resources they need to strengthen their communities. Federal agencies should work with each other and with state agencies to ensure their programs are as accessible as possible to rural communities.

Reimagining the Rural West provided a valuable regional forum to highlight the immense opportunity in the region and to examine the work that remains to be done so that rural communities have the tools and resources they need to achieve their full potential.
INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

Rural communities in the West have undergone significant social and economic transformations in the last half-century. Agriculture, mining, forestry and manufacturing formed the foundation of many rural western communities, fueling economic growth and providing an abundance of good jobs. These industries remain important to rural economies, but job creation in these traditional industries has slowed due to productivity gains, fluctuations in commodity prices, and globalization. These trends have contributed to the continuing urbanization of America and resulted in the perception that rural western communities are in decline.

While communities are certainly changing in response to global economic trends and technological innovation, the accurate picture of the rural West is not one of overall decline. Many communities have capitalized on new opportunities and are thriving as a result. Their success demonstrates what rural Westerners already know – that strong rural communities are great places to live, work and play.

When Reimagining the Rural West launched in July 2019, western states were experiencing booming economic and population growth and historically low unemployment. Western Governors were focused on ensuring that growth and prosperity reached every corner of their states. The Initiative sought to highlight rural communities that were innovating, discuss the ongoing challenges facing rural areas, and learn how states and policymakers could more effectively support vibrant communities.

Since then, the economic context has changed drastically. The COVID-19 pandemic has crippled economic growth and left millions of Americans without jobs. It is not yet clear how long-lasting the impacts will be, but it is certain that rural communities will have a difficult time rebounding unless they respond by engaging all sectors and citizens to build the communities of the future. The findings and recommendations produced by Reimagining the Rural West are largely designed to support rural communities through this crisis.

During the past year, the Initiative assembled stakeholders, policymakers and experts from around the region to discuss common challenges and to develop strategies for rural community resilience and economic development. The resulting findings and recommendations are organized around three interrelated pillars that serve as the foundation for building vibrant and prosperous rural communities:

- **Opportunity:** creating an environment in which everyone – new entrepreneurs, seasoned business owners, recent graduates starting a career, and midcareer workers pursuing new skills – has the chance to succeed and prosper.
- **Connectivity:** improving the quality of connectivity in rural areas, including broadband and transportation networks, so that rural communities can access essential goods and services, plug in to the global economy, and enjoy the myriad benefits ease of connection provides.
- **Community:** ensuring rural communities provide residents with basic needs essential to quality of life, such as clean water, housing and food security, and supporting local decisionmakers in the development and implementation of their own vision for the future.

Rural sociologist Ben Winchester, in his keynote address at the Fargo workshop, rejected the popular narrative that rural communities are dying and highlighted trends shaping successful small towns today.
Opportunity

Over the last several decades, the U.S. economy has undergone a significant shift. Several trends have combined to concentrate economic growth in metropolitan areas. Rural communities — which are more likely to rely heavily on agriculture, mining, forestry and manufacturing — have been vulnerable to fluctuations affecting those sectors. Many rural communities have also been disproportionately impacted by fires, floods and other natural disasters.

Communities across the West have been grappling with how to adapt and thrive amidst so much change. The latest challenge, the COVID-19 pandemic, is testing the resilience of rural economies like no other disaster in this lifetime.

At the same time, new opportunities abound. The global economy and increasing connectivity have made it possible for rural businesses to reach customers around the world. More Americans are able to work remotely (a trend that will likely accelerate) and many are choosing to live in the rural West. Technology and innovation are opening new frontiers in energy, agriculture and forestry, while outdoor recreation and rural tourism continue to grow. Given the substantial shifts in our economy, technologies, and social fabric, it is time for a fresh look at economic development strategies.

Traditionally, rural economic development efforts focused on recruiting businesses and industrial development. Opportunities for that kind of development are shrinking as companies outsource labor or concentrate in places with a high density of skilled workers. Today, businesses and job seekers are choosing to locate in communities that offer certain amenities or quality of life. Accordingly, development should focus on building great places to live, work, raise a family, and retire.

Community assets, like a local trail system or an attractive, walkable downtown, can serve to attract new residents, or entice young people to stay or return to their rural hometowns. Investing in quality of life and community development has become an increasingly crucial component of rural economic development.

Small businesses are the foundation of rural economies, generating tax revenue, creating jobs, providing essential goods and services, and contributing to the culture and character of small towns. By fostering a stable and diverse base of small businesses, communities become more resilient in the face of economic disruptions and can provide more and varied opportunities for innovation and growth.

To expand and diversify economic opportunities, it is important for rural communities to evaluate how well they are preparing young people for careers that are in demand locally and whether workers can retrain and upskill to adapt to changing demand.

Opportunity for All—July of 2020 marks the 30th anniversary of the Americans with Disability Act, the landmark legislation designed to ensure that every American can participate in all aspects of society, including employment. Rural populations have a higher incidence of disability than the national population, so it is critical that policies and programs to expand rural opportunity be inclusive. This is especially important because people with disabilities in rural communities face significant barriers to employment, including fewer work opportunities, limited transportation options, and lack of infrastructure to support adaptive technologies.

RECOMMENDATION: Increase flexibility of economic development funds to include investments in community assets that improve quality of life.

The Economic Development Administration (EDA) of the U.S. Department of Commerce is the lead federal agency for economic development and is a critical source of grants for rural communities. However, some rural communities report difficulty obtaining EDA funds for community asset development. EDA evaluates grant performance based on the number of jobs created or retained that are directly attributable to the project. Only those jobs that directly depend on the facility or service provided by the project are counted.

In the rural West, this metric limits the projects EDA can support. It does not account for jobs created by remote workers, entrepreneurs and business owners who make location decisions based on a community’s quality of life and amenities. Nor does it account for the higher relative impact of job creation in very small communities or areas with high unemployment or poverty rates. Congress and EDA should consider ways to increase the flexibility of EDA funding, through revised performance metrics, alternative standards for rural communities, or other means, to ensure that rural communities have the support they need to employ economic development strategies that address their goals.

RECOMMENDATION: Create an environment in which businesses, entrepreneurs, and remote workers prosper.

Building a successful business can be challenging in rural communities, and especially on tribal reservations, due to limited access to capital, reduced available workforce and smaller customer bases to support the business plan. Many successful rural businesses operate
on thin margins and, if they close, are extremely difficult to replace. The U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) and the U.S. Small Business Administration (SBA) offer loans, loan guarantees and grants to stimulate rural business development, but there is significant need for technical assistance and other support as well.

Increase investment in native CDFIs, including funding for operations, to facilitate economic development in tribal communities. The need for technical assistance on tribal lands is even more acute because many entrepreneurs are first-time borrowers. Assistance, starting with financial literacy, is often needed. Native Community Development Financial Institutions (CDFIs) are an essential tool to provide technical assistance and financing to small businesses on reservations, where business lending can be too high-risk for banks.

Increase funding for cooperative development. Cooperatives can succeed where traditional businesses may fail, and cooperative business models are being used to solve a wide range of challenges in rural communities. The Rural Cooperative Development Grant (RCDG) program of USDA Rural Development is the only federal program funding technical assistance to launch and support cooperative businesses. New cooperatives need significant support, technical assistance, and ongoing education to succeed.

The annual appropriation for the RCDG program is not sufficient to meet the needs of every state. Funding for cooperative development should be increased to support the growing use of cooperative models to meet a diverse array of community needs, including grocery stores, childcare, homecare, and housing. Adequate funding is also necessary to support the ongoing functions of agricultural cooperatives in the West. Programs administered by USDA’s Agricultural Marketing Service and National Institute of Food and Agriculture help support value-added production activities, food systems partnerships and market promotion.

Stabilize small businesses during disasters. In the wake of disasters in rural communities, including the COVID-19

The Reimagining the Rural West Initiative workshop series kicked off in North Dakota, delivering a wealth of ideas and strategies to revitalize western communities.

North Dakota Gov. Doug Burgum talked about the “opportunity we have in the West to do things that are remarkable,” rural sociologist Ben Winchester deconstructed what he called an “inaccurate” rural narrative, and board members of the Maddock Opera House delivered an entertaining explanation of the renovation project that’s become central to their small community.

The event in Fargo included opening remarks from the Governor that stressed the region’s considerable potential. Gov. Burgum noted that states have “an opportunity in the West to do things that are completely remarkable,” Gov. Burgum said. “An opportunity to solve issues with rural health. An opportunity to build world class education. An opportunity to build healthy, vibrant communities.”

“We have to work together with our tribal nations,” the Governor added. “We have a responsibility as state leaders to help tribal members in our rural communities and on reservations.”

Winchester, of the University of Minnesota Extension Center for Community Vitality, challenged the current rural narrative in his keynote: “The narrative we use to describe our small towns is terrible. And it’s dated. The narrative is written about us, not by us.”

Winchester challenged common notions of success and failure. “Brain drain is when your high school kids graduate and a number of them leave. But that’s not a failure: It’s a measure of success when your children go out in the world and succeed. But they’ve got to know that they can come home.”

Through a series of insightful roundtable discussions, panelists at the workshop explained how to help rural communities foster entrepreneurship and innovation, as well as develop local leaders. The conversations also highlighted the Fargo Main Street project, the Maddock Opera House renovation that energized a North Dakota town, and emerging trends in agriculture.

“In any community, you find there’s a lot more talent than you think there is,” said Maddock Opera House Association board member Lee Hagen.

“Stabilize small businesses during disasters. In the wake of disasters in rural communities, including the COVID-19...”

Fargo, North Dakota (Oct. 1, 2019)

The Reimagining the Rural West Initiative workshop series kicked off in North Dakota, delivering a wealth of ideas and strategies to revitalize western communities.

North Dakota Gov. Doug Burgum talked about the “opportunity we have in the West to do things that are remarkable,” rural sociologist Ben Winchester deconstructed what he called an “inaccurate” rural narrative, and board members of the Maddock Opera House delivered an entertaining explanation of the renovation project that’s become central to their small community.

The event in Fargo included opening remarks from the Governor that stressed the region’s considerable potential. Gov. Burgum noted that states have “an opportunity in the West to do things that are completely remarkable,” Gov. Burgum said. “An opportunity to solve issues with rural health. An opportunity to build world class education. An opportunity to build healthy, vibrant communities.”

“We have to work together with our tribal nations,” the Governor added. “We have a responsibility as state leaders to help tribal members in our rural communities and on reservations.”

Winchester, of the University of Minnesota Extension Center for Community Vitality, challenged the current rural narrative in his keynote: “The narrative we use to describe our small towns is terrible. And it’s dated. The narrative is written about us, not by us.”

Winchester challenged common notions of success and failure. “Brain drain is when your high school kids graduate and a number of them leave. But that’s not a failure: It’s a measure of success when your children go out in the world and succeed. But they’ve got to know that they can come home.”

Through a series of insightful roundtable discussions, panelists at the workshop explained how to help rural communities foster entrepreneurship and innovation, as well as develop local leaders. The conversations also highlighted the Fargo Main Street project, the Maddock Opera House renovation that energized a North Dakota town, and emerging trends in agriculture.

“In any community, you find there’s a lot more talent than you think there is,” said Maddock Opera House Association board member Lee Hagen.

Winchester, of the University of Minnesota Extension Center for Community Vitality, challenged the current rural narrative in his keynote: “The narrative we use to describe our small towns is terrible. And it’s dated. The narrative is written about us, not by us.”

Winchester challenged common notions of success and failure. “Brain drain is when your high school kids graduate and a number of them leave. But that’s not a failure: It’s a measure of success when your children go out in the world and succeed. But they’ve got to know that they can come home.”

Through a series of insightful roundtable discussions, panelists at the workshop explained how to help rural communities foster entrepreneurship and innovation, as well as develop local leaders. The conversations also highlighted the Fargo Main Street project, the Maddock Opera House renovation that energized a North Dakota town, and emerging trends in agriculture.

Winchester, of the University of Minnesota Extension Center for Community Vitality, challenged the current rural narrative in his keynote: “The narrative we use to describe our small towns is terrible. And it’s dated. The narrative is written about us, not by us.”

Winchester challenged common notions of success and failure. “Brain drain is when your high school kids graduate and a number of them leave. But that’s not a failure: It’s a measure of success when your children go out in the world and succeed. But they’ve got to know that they can come home.”

Through a series of insightful roundtable discussions, panelists at the workshop explained how to help rural communities foster entrepreneurship and innovation, as well as develop local leaders. The conversations also highlighted the Fargo Main Street project, the Maddock Opera House renovation that energized a North Dakota town, and emerging trends in agriculture.

“In any community, you find there’s a lot more talent than you think there is,” said Maddock Opera House Association board member Lee Hagen.
During COVID-19 response, many small lenders could not access federal funds to support their communities because they did not meet program thresholds or were unable to compete against large banks. Small lenders, including CDFIs, community banks, and credit unions, are often the only lenders serving rural and tribal communities. In the ongoing response to the economic effects of COVID-19, Congress should set aside emergency relief funds for small lenders and ensure that program requirements allow those entities to participate through a streamlined process to rapidly distribute resources while maintaining fiscal accountability. This principle should also apply in other disaster response situations, such as earthquakes, flooding and wildfire, to promote the stabilization of small businesses in affected communities.

RECOMMENDATION: Educate and train rural citizens for the jobs that are available in their communities.

As rural communities adapt to changing economic trends, it is critical that workforce development efforts keep pace. A nimble and responsive workforce development system integrates K-12 education, post-secondary education, and regional employers to ensure that students and jobseekers can gain the skills they need for the jobs that are in demand locally.

Train the rural workforce for the jobs that are in demand. Sectors such as outdoor recreation, tourism and healthcare have growing demand for workers in rural communities. Opportunities for location-neutral work are also increasingly available in communities with adequate connectivity.

Developing a Remote Workforce – Rural economic developers can connect local residents with the training and resources they need to get location-neutral jobs and bring new income into the community. Although Utah has one of the fastest growing economies in the West, much of that growth has been concentrated in the Wasatch Front, with rural counties experiencing higher unemployment rates than the state average. In 2018, Utah Gov. Gary Herbert signed the Rural Online Initiative into law, creating a program to provide rural Utahns with education, training, and services to pursue remote employment and business opportunities. As part of the program, Utah State University Extension created an online certificate course to train remote work professionals. The program is giving rural residents the opportunity to find employment or increase their salaries. Counties and local programs across the West are now utilizing the USU Extension certificate program to prepare their workforce for remote work.

Sky City Cultural Center & Haak‘u Museum in New Mexico, which offers insights into the history of the Acoma Pueblo, illustrates how cultural heritage tourism can help drive sustainable economic growth.

Western Governors are also committed to increasing employment among veterans and the disabled in the rural West.

Expand programs that help young people enter rural career paths. Many young people in rural areas struggle to see a future for themselves in their communities and are not aware of career opportunities that would encourage them to stay or return. An important element of community development is educating young people about the opportunities that exist in their town or area and investing them with the tools necessary to acquire employment that is in demand.

Rural communities have older populations on average and many workers and business owners are nearing retirement. (The agriculture sector, in
WGA Executive Director Jim Ogsbury opened the Santa Fe workshop by reminding attendees that, thanks to technology, “people in western rural communities are not in the middle of nowhere, they are in the middle of everywhere.”

New Mexico Gov. Michelle Lujan Grisham emphasized collaboration among western states and the importance of seeing challenges as opportunities at the second workshop of the Reimagining the Rural West Initiative.

Gov. Lujan Grisham lauded the Chairman’s Initiative of WGA Chair, North Dakota Gov. Doug Burgum, for taking on issues that pose obstacles for rural communities to thrive, such as access to broadband and food security.

“The highlight for me in this workshop is the notion that we in the West don’t think about challenges and opportunities as mutually exclusive propositions,” said Gov. Lujan Grisham. “Take our ethos to protect our unique and beautiful natural environment. We in the West don’t consider the ethos to be protective of the environment coming at the expense of our economies.”

Speakers at the workshop included Rebeckah Freeman Adcock and Arthur Garcia of the U.S. Department of Agriculture, who spoke about the agency’s efforts to build robust rural communities; Nadia Mossburg of the U.S. Department of Labor spoke about the future of remote work; and leadership of regional and national organizations discussing the factors that limit rural food access and strategies to address food insecurity.

Connectivity

Connectivity is essential to fueling rural economic development and improving quality of life. In the West, where rural areas are vast and communities are often remote and isolated, broadband and transportation connectivity are both critically important.

Broadband

High-speed internet, commonly referred to as ‘broadband,’ is critical infrastructure and a modern-day necessity for businesses, individuals, schools and government. Given the digital transformation that society has undergone in recent decades, one might assume that broadband coverage is ubiquitous in the U.S., but this is far from the case. Many rural, tribal and low-income communities across the West lack access to this critical infrastructure.

Communities without broadband access face significant barriers to pursuing economic and community prosperity. Nonexistent or low-quality broadband access prevents small businesses from particular, is in need of new farmers.) Apprenticeships and internships can help expose young people to a wide range of career options and transfer skills to the next generation.
executing online transactions, inhibits distance learning and remote work, and impedes the delivery of telehealth and telemedicine services to residents. For rural and tribal communities to reach their full economic potential, access to robust, reliable and affordable broadband is essential.

The COVID-19 pandemic has demonstrated the importance of broadband access in responding to emergency situations and promoting a wide range of economic, health care, educational and social opportunities. It is an essential tool for enabling the remote work and e-commerce that can sustain a local business. Adequate broadband can facilitate routine health monitoring and assessment, and help students maintain their educational progress. It can also allow families and friends to remain connected during times of social distancing.

Rural and tribal communities lack access to broadband infrastructure primarily due to the absence of a business case for private investment. The vast distances and challenging terrain common in western states greatly increase the cost of building and maintaining broadband infrastructure. The low number of potential customers in rural areas further minimizes the return on investment for Internet Service Providers (ISPs). Complicated permitting and siting practices across public lands can introduce additional costs and delays to broadband deployment projects with minimal margin for error.

Due to the prohibitive cost of broadband infrastructure, state or federal assistance is often needed to deploy and support viable connectivity solutions for rural and tribal communities. These efforts include direct investing in rural areas, establishing state broadband offices, addressing regulatory hurdles that impede broadband infrastructure investment, and promoting creative public-private partnerships that deliver connectivity solutions.

The federal government has an important role to play in supporting broadband infrastructure deployment across the West. The Federal Communications Commission (FCC) and USDA are the primary agencies funding on-the-ground broadband deployment projects in western states. The FCC also manages federal broadband coverage maps, which depict where broadband access is and is not available. Accurate and granular broadband coverage maps are necessary to promote successful and cost-effective public broadband investments. Additionally, the U.S. Forest Service (USFS) and U.S. Department of the Interior (DOI) permit and manage broadband infrastructure on public lands. Improved coordination and data sharing between states and federal agencies can help promote efficient and fiscally responsible broadband investments.

Fixed broadband providers in western states include a diverse mix of entities, such as private ISPs, electric and telephone cooperatives, municipalities, non-profit organizations and tribal nations. This mix of private and public broadband service providers underscores how closing the “digital divide” is not subject to a one-size-fits-all approach. Federal programs must be broadly accessible and support innovative partnerships to leverage the strengths of various broadband providers.

Many of the challenges that rural communities face in accessing broadband connectivity are exacerbated on tribal lands. Like many rural communities, tribal nations often lack easy access to fiber optic cable and face technical challenges due to rugged terrain. Tribes face a host of additional barriers to improving broadband connectivity across their lands. For example, it can be very challenging for broadband providers to gain access to rights of way (ROWs) across lands managed by the Bureau of Indian Affairs. In addition, tribes can struggle to obtain credit and financing options due to issues with collateralizing assets that are held in trust by the federal government.
RECOMMENDATION: Incorporate State Data into Federal Broadband Coverage Maps.

National broadband coverage maps have historically overstated broadband coverage in western rural and tribal areas. States have on-the-ground data and expertise regarding where broadband access is available within their borders, and this information should be leveraged by the FCC and other federal agencies to improve federal broadband investments. The recent enactment of the Broadband DATA Act presents a valuable opportunity for the FCC to integrate state data and expertise into their coverage maps and planning processes.

RECOMMENDATION: Invest in Scalable Networks.

Broadband infrastructure must support advanced uses, such as distance learning, precision agriculture, telehealth, and telemedicine, for communities to truly prosper. Many of these applications rely on robust upload capacity, not just high-speed download capabilities. Federal broadband programs must prioritize and fund future-proof, scalable networks that promote innovative applications and can be cost-effectively upgraded as data transmission needs expand.

RECOMMENDATION: Leverage Existing Infrastructure and Rights-of-Way.

The environmental review, permitting and access costs associated with broadband infrastructure projects can be substantial. To reduce these costly barriers and accelerate deployment, state and federal agencies should promote colocation of broadband infrastructure with existing structures and other linear infrastructure (roads, electricity transmission lines, water and wastewater systems, etc.). Given their existing infrastructure and ROW access, electric and telephone cooperatives are especially well suited to help deploy cost-effective broadband infrastructure.

RECOMMENDATION: Expedite and Coordinate Permitting and Siting on Federal Lands.

Federal review and permitting processes can introduce substantial costs and delays to broadband infrastructure projects. The USFS and DOI should pursue strategies to prioritize and expedite reviews for broadband infrastructure on public lands. Where projects cross multiple public lands jurisdictions, improved agency-to-agency coordination is needed to ensure projects are not unreasonably delayed.

RECOMMENDATION: Utilize Anchor Institutions and “To and Through” Strategies to Promote Community Connectivity.

Many federal broadband programs direct funding to community anchor institutions: schools, libraries, health care centers and public safety entities. By investing in scalable broadband infrastructure and utilizing “to and through” policies — such as permitting network interconnection, shared use, and leasing of excess capacity — federal agencies and Congress can promote further public or private investment beyond anchor institutions to unserved residences and businesses. Federal programs, including the FCC’s E-Rate Program, should incorporate flexible open access policies and leverage existing broadband at schools and libraries to address students’ and community members’ home connectivity needs.

RECOMMENDATION: Prioritize Assistance to Tribal Communities and Service Providers.

Congress and federal agencies should pursue policy, programmatic and fiscal opportunities to improve broadband connectivity on tribal lands. This includes designing federal programs to promote partnerships between states, tribes and various broadband providers. Where possible, federal programs should allocate a designated portion of their funds to broadband infrastructure projects on tribal lands.

Leveraging Rights of Way – The Colorado state legislature passed a suite of measures to promote broadband deployment statewide. The legislation directs the Colorado Department of Transportation and local governments to notify broadband providers of trenching projects along highway ROWs. Broadband providers then have the option to colocate their connectivity infrastructure with highway facilities, and water, wastewater, electric and gas lines. This practice can significantly reduce broadband infrastructure permitting and siting costs for providers. The bill also waives state sales and use taxes for broadband equipment and promotes broadband providers’ access to public ROWs.

Coordinating Permitting Processes – The Utah Education and Telehealth Network contracted with STRATA Networks to deliver fiber optic service to the towns of Dutch John and Manila in Daggett County, the least populous county in Utah. Due to diverse public lands ownership in Utah, STRATA Networks has worked with the USFS, Bureau of Land Management, Bureau of Reclamation (BOR), Utah Department of Transportation, Uintah County, and Daggett County to complete various permitting and siting procedures. Due to effective collaboration between STRATA Networks and federal and state agencies, all environmental, paleontological, and archaeological reviews, mitigation activities, and permitting processes were completed in 10 months. The BOR even allowed STRATA Networks to lay fiber within the internal tunnel systems at Flaming Gorge Dam to expedite project delivery.
The Idaho workshop highlighted strategies to upgrade energy efficiency in rural areas, engage new communities in the outdoor recreation industry, and increase access to remote telehealth services.

In opening remarks, Gov. Brad Little welcomed the wealth of ideas being generated by the Reimagining the Rural West Initiative. “I worship at the altar of stealing good ideas from other states, so I am all about this Initiative’s goals,” he said.

During the Rural Energy for the Future panel, the Governor explained how affordable energy is essential to rural prosperity. “When we do economic development in rural areas, companies need to know they will have reliable power.”

Other roundtables at the event in Post Falls included an analysis of historical changes to natural resource markets, strategies to create markets supporting ecosystem-based goals, and federal programs that can aid rural infrastructure challenges.

Panelists such as Jorge Guzmán of Vive NW explored how different organizations are working to build recreation economies, while Kate LaTour of the National Cooperative Business Association explained how cooperative models can support diverse rural development goals. Krista Stadler of St. Luke’s Health System shared the importance of creating remote-access health care options.

George Brown and Joel E. Nania from the U.S. Small Business Administration (SBA) examined challenges that complicate the process of economic revitalization in rural communities, including physical isolation and limited access to capital. Additionally, they explained how the SBA is deploying resources to address these challenges and prioritize rural development.
Transportation

Good transportation networks are essential to rural quality of life, connecting residents to jobs, educational opportunities and health care and social services that may be unavailable in their immediate community. Transportation also supports economic development. For businesses and workers, ease of travel is an important factor affecting location decisions and opportunities for growth. For tourism and recreation economies, highways and air service are key constraining factors for visitation.

Physically isolated communities face many transportation-related challenges. Poor transportation connectivity increases the cost of distributing goods, making it more difficult for local businesses to succeed. During emergencies, supply chains to remote communities may be interrupted or assistance may take longer to arrive. Rural residents in communities with poor transportation networks spend more time and accrue more costs conducting everyday business, diminishing quality of life.

In the West, where rural areas are vast and communities are separated by rugged terrain, air service is a necessity. Many rural communities rely on air service to access essential goods and services. It is difficult for commercial airlines to make a profit on rural routes, so subsidies are often needed to ensure these communities are served.

The air industry has been especially hard-hit by the COVID-19 pandemic and commercial airlines are expected to suffer long-term business impacts. Rural routes with minimal profit margins are likely to be at risk of decreased or discontinued service as the industry recovers in the coming years.

**RECOMMENDATION:** Ensure Continued and Expanded Rural Air Service.

The Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) Essential Air Service program subsidizes commercial airlines serving rural communities that would otherwise not be profitable routes. Of the 100 communities that participate in the Essential Air Service program, 63 are in the West. It is critical that these subsidies be maintained. Given the impacts of COVID-19 on the air industry, additional investments and policy changes are needed to address pilot shortages and infrastructure constraints. Airline consolidation effects must also be addressed to ensure that rural communities continue to be served.

**MuralNet provides infrastructure such as this, as well as consulting and financial resources, so that tribal nations and tribally controlled organizations can build their own networks.**

**Expanding Tribal Access – Red Spectrum Communications,** a tribally owned broadband provider, delivers broadband service to families and community buildings across the Coeur d’Alene reservation in Idaho. Red Spectrum provides fiber-to-the-premise connectivity to most municipal buildings and the majority of community members, and also utilizes microwave wireless solutions for areas lacking fiber access. In March 2020, the FCC authorized over $500,000 in Connect America Fund support for Red Spectrum Communications to expand broadband access in Benewah County, Idaho.
Ben Alexander discussed transitions by western communities with traditionally energy-focused economies.

The Senior Program Advisor for the Resources Legacy Fund also described a “change framework” for communities to use to determine their economic options, while emphasizing the importance of strong local leadership in developing a vision to achieve success.

Panelists later examined the complexities of wastewater systems in rural contexts, explored efforts to increase the flow of capital to rural communities, and identified replicable solutions to housing challenges across the rural West.

“People tend to assume that access to water and sanitation is only a problem in low-income countries, and regions such as Sub-Saharan Africa, when in fact, at least 2.2 million Americans face these issues,” said George McGraw, CEO of DigDeep.

Russ Elliott of the Washington State Broadband Office joined Carrie Pipinich of Mid-Columbia Economic Development District to explore how communities are assembling broad coalitions to work toward the shared goal of broadband access. Later, officials from the Oregon Farm Bureau, Farmer Veteran Coalition, and Oregon State University highlighted how the next generation of farmers are changing the agricultural landscape.

The two-day workshop concluded with a conversation about how rural communities across the West can mitigate risks of wildfire. “Community well-being and natural resource management are closely related,” said Cassandra Moseley, a research professor at the University of Oregon’s Institute for a Sustainable Environment. “The actions we take to prepare for wildfire help us address other community issues.”

Community

By offering exceptional quality of life, rural communities can attract new residents, retain young people, and sustain their economies through turbulent transitions. This will help develop rural communities that are attractive places to live and work while protecting their rural character, resource-based industries, and natural areas.

Quality of life signifies many different things. For one thing, it comprehends the provision of basic needs. For the many rural communities in the West in which basic needs are not being met, particularly on tribal reservations, the satisfaction of those needs is fundamental to both economic development and community health. Clean drinking water, housing, health care services and access to healthy food are key concerns.

For other communities, ensuring there is access to childcare, housing for middle-income workers, opportunities to enjoy arts and culture, or nearby parks and open space may be critical factors in improving livability. Every community in the rural West has different assets and challenges.

Each community also has different values and preferences. The development of local leadership to identify those values and capacity to accommodate those preferences is fundamental to building great communities. Rural development efforts are much more successful in communities where citizens have a shared vision for the future and can leverage local resources to realize that vision. Community-led solutions are more effective at addressing urgent needs and capitalizing on opportunities. They are also more efficient than overly prescribed programs and strategies imposed from above.

Many resources are available to communities to help fund critical infrastructure and improve quality of life, but the need is generally greater than available funding. Winning competitive grants and loans takes a great deal of time and expertise. Rural communities and the organizations that serve them have limited resources; local governments and utilities have small tax bases and private philanthropy in rural areas is scarce. Many critical leadership positions are held by volunteers rather than professional managers or trained staff. This limits capacity to compete for and manage grants and loans. Policies and programs for economic development, infrastructure, and rural challenges should strive to be as accessible as possible to rural applicants while also...

2020 REPORT: REIMAGINING THE RURAL WEST INITIATIVE • 15
building capacity in those communities and organizations over time.

Challenges in the rural West include:

**Water and Wastewater Systems:** Clean drinking water and wastewater facilities are critical to economic development and community health. Water infrastructure in rural western communities is aging, but rural communities often lack a sufficient rate base to finance improvements. The West also has a high proportion of households without access to running water and plumbing. Most of these homes are on tribal reservations that did not benefit from federal infrastructure investments in the 20th century.

USDA funds water and wastewater infrastructure through loan programs. To qualify, water systems must show that they can pay off those loans through rate charges. Given the essential role of water for business development and rural health, more grant funding is needed to ensure that all western citizens are served.

Another challenge is the shortage of water system operators. Many water system operators are nearing retirement. Developing this workforce – or implementing other solutions, such as regionalization, that allow systems to share management – is a high priority.

**Housing:** Housing has become a serious constraint on economic growth in rural communities across the West. People are interested in moving to rural areas to escape high housing costs in urban areas, but housing is unaffordable in many rural western communities, particularly those that are popular tourism or retirement destinations.

Housing is an integral part of community development. Without the right types and price points of available homes, businesses cannot attract new employees, young people can’t afford to stay, and essential workers (such as teachers, nurses and firefighters) get crowded out.

Programs exist to help build and maintain affordable housing in rural communities, but there are not enough resources to meet demand. For middle-income housing, each community has different obstacles and assets at its disposal. Cooperatives, land trusts and creative partnerships with the private sector, employers or local foundations can help, but local capacity is essential to bring those parties together and develop locally tailored solutions.

There is a severe shortage of construction workers in rural communities, and efforts to address housing shortages should take this into account as well.

**Food Security:** The high cost of distribution to western rural communities can make it difficult for grocery stores, food banks and schools to supply healthy and fresh food. When a rural grocery store closes, it can have cascading effects on the community. Rural communities are utilizing cooperative grocery stores, shared distribution networks, and strategies to strengthen local agricultural economies and ensure that rural communities have access to healthy food.

The COVID-19 pandemic has exacerbated food supply and distribution challenges and caused costly disruptions for growers, value-added businesses, processing facilities, distribution companies and food retailers, including farmers’ markets. To avoid long-lasting and severe impacts to food security, rural communities need creative solutions that can be implemented collaboratively by federal, state, and local entities. Western states are leading the way in identifying market opportunities to connect surplus agricultural products with food insecure families and communities.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

**Strengthen local leadership and capacity.**

Investing in the people and organizations that serve rural communities makes it easier for communities to develop their own vision and implement their own strategy for the future. It also makes public investments more effective by ensuring that more communities can successfully apply for and deploy available resources.

**Increase funding for rural capacity-building and social infrastructure.** More funding, and more consistent funding, is needed for institutions, training, and technical assistance to help communities comprehensively address development needs and conduct post-disaster restoration work.

Congress should direct federal agencies that fund rural development projects and disaster mitigation work to provide a larger proportion of program funds to capacity-building efforts.

**Foster local leadership and rural networks.** Community leaders need to be cultivated. Leadership training can help connect people in different communities who are working on similar goals.
leadership and community networks are also essential. Resources and capacity will always be scarcer in rural areas. Connecting rural communities and encouraging collaboration can better leverage limited resources.

**Strengthen Cooperative Extension for the 21st Century.** The Cooperative Extension System, which serves every county in western states, is an important asset in rural communities. Cooperative Extension Services (CES) can play a more meaningful role in economic and community development efforts in rural areas. Continued and increased federal investment in CES is necessary to help Extension representatives address local needs and promote community prosperity in rural areas.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

- Improve the efficacy of federal and state programs to support critical infrastructure in the rural West.

In addition to building capacity, there are many steps policymakers can take to make resources more easily accessible to rural communities and organizations.

**Reduce barriers to accessing federal resources.** Federal agencies should work with Governors and state agencies to evaluate program requirements, identify barriers for rural applicants, and revise rules in a manner that recognizes rural realities.

**Use state data to determine eligibility when feasible.** States frequently have more current and accurate data than is available from federal sources. Since accurate data on local incomes, access to services, and other community characteristics is used to determine eligibility for assistance, federal agencies should defer to data collected by states when it is available.

**Encourage coordination among state and federal agencies, within states and regionally, to leverage resources and help rural entities navigate their options.** Rural applicants must navigate a complex bureaucracy of federal and state programs to access the resources they need to strengthen their communities. Federal agencies should work with each other and with state agencies to serve rural customers as efficiently as possible.

---

**Fostering Rural Leaders –** The Main Street ND Summit is an annual gathering of local and regional community-building experts and advocates to share best practices and engage community leaders, entrepreneurs, students and interested citizens in envisioning North Dakota’s future. The multi-day summit features dozens of breakout sessions on a range of issues in community and economic development. Themes include accessing financing, engaging young people, strengthening arts and culture, and fostering entrepreneurs. The summit creates a platform for rural leaders not only to learn and access resources, but to develop relationships and network with their peers, and work together on shared goals.

---

**Coordinating Resources –** Business Oregon, the state economic development agency, makes it easier for communities to find funding solutions for their projects by hosting One-Stop Financing Roundtables. Any stakeholder working on a potential project on behalf of its community can request a “One-Stop.” Business Oregon facilitates the rest, assembling funders from the state and USDA Rural Development to meet with community decision makers. The community is given clear guidance on next steps and a variety of possible funding scenarios.

---

Rebeckah Freeman Adcock of the U.S. Department of Agriculture described efforts by the department to build robust, sustainable communities for generations to come during the Santa Fe workshop.
WEBINARS

The Reimagining the Rural West Initiative launched with a webinar hosted by WGA Chair and North Dakota Governor Doug Burgum. Subsequent webinars hosted by WGA highlighted issues that arose from workshop conversations. When the impact of COVID-19 became clear, WGA launched a series that explored what the pandemic meant for rural communities at the heart of the Initiative’s work. The following is a breakdown of the issues examined in our webinars, all of which may be viewed on WGA’s website or YouTube Channel.

CONNECTIVITY

Broadband Data & Mapping: Federal Action & Developments
The Federal Communications Commission’s ongoing Digital Opportunity Data Collection project was the subject of this webinar, as well as legislative efforts to improve broadband data and mapping.

Broadband Deployment in Tribal Communities
Panelists discussed broadband infrastructure challenges affecting tribal communities and creative ways that wireless spectrum can close the digital divide in these areas.

Broadband Investments by Electric and Telephone Cooperatives
Electric and telephone cooperatives face logistical and regulatory barriers when developing broadband infrastructure. Learn about those barriers and how federal programs for smart grid investments can increase broadband deployment.

Community Anchor Institution Connectivity
Learn about federal programs that direct broadband investments to schools, libraries, hospitals, and community centers, as well as the role of anchor institutions during the pandemic.

PANDEMIC IMPACTS

Economic Impacts and Mitigation in Rural Communities
• Part I: Learn about the many federal resources available to rural communities to mitigate the economic impacts of the pandemic.
• Part II: Officials from western rural communities share their strategies for mitigating short-term economic impacts and long-term recovery plans.
• Part III: Listen to a discussion of the challenges facing businesses in rural communities, obstacles that limit the effectiveness of federal aid programs, and next steps for recovery.

Rural Health Response to COVID-19
Idaho’s Blaine County was an early hot spot of COVID-19 cases; county leaders explain how they responded and continue to manage the virus.

Other topics covered in initiative webinars include:

Reimagining Disability Employment Policy in the Rural West
Hear about disability employment best practices and policy options, as well as how the State Exchange on Employment & Disability works with state leaders.

COVID-19: Cybersecurity Threats & Best Practices
Cyber threats are growing as states, schools, health care facilities, and businesses transition to remote solutions. Find out how to counter malicious campaigns.

Improving Airports and Air Service in the Rural West
Air service is critical to rural prosperity. Learn about funding sources and best practices for communities to maintain air facilities.
The Reimagining the Rural West Initiative has examined challenges and highlighted opportunities in rural economic development, infrastructure and quality of life. The Initiative has organized around three major pillars: Opportunity, Connectivity, and Community. To ensure the conversation reaches the widest possible audience, WGA launched an online resource that includes videos of all workshops and webinars, as well as episodes of the “Out West” podcast. WGA also created the Initiative Appendix, a document that delivers expanded detail on the conversations at each workshop and webinar.

WORKSHOPS
WGA organized four regional Initiative workshops, which were livestreamed to the public via YouTube and Facebook. Workshops were hosted by Governors Doug Burgum in North Dakota, Michelle Lujan Grisham in New Mexico, and Brad Little in Idaho. The final workshop, hosted by Oregon Governor Kate Brown, was presented virtually, owing to the COVID-19 pandemic. All workshops may be viewed on WGA’s website or YouTube Channel.

WEBINARS
The Initiative was launched with a webinar hosted by WGA Chair and North Dakota Governor Doug Burgum. Subsequent webinars hosted by WGA highlighted issues that arose from workshop conversations, such as Broadband Investments by Electric and Telephone Cooperatives. When the impact of COVID-19 became clear, WGA launched a series that explored what it means for the rural communities at the heart of the Initiative’s work. Webinar topics included a three-part series on Economic Impacts and Mitigation in Rural Communities, as well as Cybersecurity Threats & Best Practices, and webinars that explored the pandemic’s effect on natural resource management. All webinars may be viewed on WGA’s website or YouTube Channel.

PODCASTS
WGA launched Out West, its official podcast, with a series that examines issues pertaining to the Reimagining the Rural West Initiative, including rural economic development, infrastructure and quality of life. The episodes are available on Podbean, Spotify, or Apple Podcasts.
The Western Governors’ Association thanks the following for their support of the Reimagining the Rural West Initiative

INITIATIVE SPONSORS

Grow with Google

WESTERN GOVERNORS UNIVERSITY

INITIATIVE SIGNATURE SPONSORS

U.S. TRAVEL ASSOCIATION

SHAREOURSTRENGTH

INITIATIVE SUPPORTERS

Idaho Forest Group

MDU RESOURCES GROUP, INC.

Deloitte

INITIATIVE AFFILIATES

AMERICA’S SBDC

ANN WALKER CONSULTING

INITIATIVE FUNDING ALSO PROVIDED BY

United States Department of Agriculture
PARTICIPANTS

WGA appreciates the time and effort that workshop panelists invested in the Initiative.

THE PANELISTS AND SPEAKERS

Workshop: Fargo, North Dakota, October 1, 2019
The Honorable Doug Burgum, Governor of North Dakota
Benjamin Winchester, Rural Sociologist, Center for Community Vitality, University of Minnesota Extension
Michelle Kommer, Commissioner, North Dakota Department of Commerce
Katharine Ferguson, Associate Director, Community Strategies Group, The Aspen Institute
Greg Tehven, Executive Director, Emerging Prairie
Jennifer Groth, Policy and Partnerships Manager, Rural Development Initiatives
Bob Walton, Fargo District Engineer, North Dakota Department of Transportation
Paul Backstrom, Board Member, Maddock Opera House Association
Lee Hagen, Board Member, Maddock Opera House Association
Rachel Markestad, Board Member, Maddock Opera House Association
Kim Konikow, Executive Director, North Dakota Council on the Arts
Clare Carlson, North Dakota State Director, Rural Development, U.S. Department of Agriculture
Justin Forde, Senior Director of Government Relations, Midco
Jake Joraanstad, Chief Executive Officer, Bushel
Paul Sproule, Owner, Sproule Farms
Matthew Dalbey, Director, Office of Community Revitalization, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Kevin Adam, Director, Arizona Rural Transportation Advocacy Council
William Panos, Director, North Dakota Department of Transportation
Anne Reinke, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Intergovernmental Affairs, U.S. Department of Transportation
Mary Anne Carter, Chair, National Endowment for the Arts
Deb Belquist, Managing Director, Dakota Prairie Regional Center for the Arts
Margaret Hunt, Executive Director, Colorado Creative Industries
Jennifer Irving, Deputy Director, Thunder Valley Community Development Corporation

Workshop: Santa Fe, New Mexico, November 4-5, 2019
The Honorable Michelle Lujan Grisham, Governor of New Mexico
Rebeckah Freeman Adcock, Senior Advisor to the Secretary, U.S. Department of Agriculture
Arthur Garcia, New Mexico State Director, Rural Development, U.S. Department of Agriculture
Jack Morgan, Community and Economic Development Program Manager, National Association of Counties
Daniel Stenberg, Economic Development Coordinator, McKenzie County, North Dakota
Kent Wilson, Commissioner, Emery County, Utah
Arvin Trujillo, Chief Executive Officer, Four Corners Economic Development
Jeff Edwards, Executive Director, Utah Advanced Materials and Manufacturing Initiative
Melissa Fox, Program Director of Applied Energy Programs, Los Alamos National Lab
Melvin Juanico, Operations Manager, Sky City Cultural Center and Haak’u Museum
Angelisa Murray, Owner and Guide, Heritage Inspirations
Sherry Rupert, Executive Director, American Indian Alaska Native Tourism Association
William Symonds, Director, Global Pathways Institute
Charles Massie, Executive Director of External Programs, Klamath Community College
Ben Thomas, Executive Director, Rocky Mountain Youth Corps
Gregory Zick, Assistant Vice President of Workforce Development, National Association of Home Builders
Shelly Fausett, Center Director, SoloWorks Cibola
Paul Hill, Associate Professor, Utah State University Extension
Nadia Mossburg, Senior Policy Advisor, Office of Disability Employment Policy, U.S. Department of Labor
Gloria Begay, Executive Director, Diné Food Sovereignty Alliance
Sherry Hooper, Executive Director, The Food Depot

Sherry Rupert of the American Indian Alaska Native Tourism Association shared ideas about developing cultural heritage tourism during an Initiative workshop.

Workshop: Post Falls, Idaho, December 3, 2019
The Honorable Brad Little, Governor of Idaho
Mark Brodziski, Deputy Administrator, Rural Business-Cooperative Service, U.S. Department of Agriculture
John Chatburn, Administrator, Idaho Governor’s Office of Energy and Mineral Resources
Mark Peters, Director, Idaho National Laboratory
Peter West, Director of Energy Programs, Energy Trust of Oregon
Matt Krumenauer, Vice President of Special Projects, U.S. Endowment for Forestry and Communities
Chelsea Pennick McIver, Research Analyst, Policy Analysis Group, University of Idaho

Pam Roy, Executive Director and Co-founder, Farm to Table New Mexico

Derrick Lambert, Senior Manager, No Kid Hungry Campaign by Share Our Strength

Workshop: Post Falls, Idaho, December 3, 2019
The Honorable Brad Little, Governor of Idaho
Mark Brodziski, Deputy Administrator, Rural Business-Cooperative Service, U.S. Department of Agriculture
John Chatburn, Administrator, Idaho Governor’s Office of Energy and Mineral Resources
Mark Peters, Director, Idaho National Laboratory
Peter West, Director of Energy Programs, Energy Trust of Oregon
Matt Krumenauer, Vice President of Special Projects, U.S. Endowment for Forestry and Communities
Chelsea Pennick McIver, Research Analyst, Policy Analysis Group, University of Idaho

Pam Roy, Executive Director and Co-founder, Farm to Table New Mexico

Derrick Lambert, Senior Manager, No Kid Hungry Campaign by Share Our Strength
Jeremy Field, Regional Administrator for Region X, U.S. Small Business Administration

Stephanie Sims, Executive Director, International Selkirk Loop; Board Chair, North Idaho Tourism Alliance

Colleen Rosson, Executive Director, Silver Valley Economic Development Corporation; Board Vice Chair, North Idaho Tourism Alliance

Lindsey Shirley, University Outreach and Engagement Associate Provost, Oregon State University Extension

Jorge Guzmán, Founder and Executive Director, Vive NW

Tara McKee, Program Manager, Utah Office of Outdoor Recreation

Joe Alexander, Director of Recreation, Minerals, Lands, Heritage and Wilderness for Region I, U.S. Forest Service

Lori Capouch, Rural Development Director, North Dakota Association of Rural Electric Cooperatives

Tim Freeburg, Board Member, Pacific Northwest Farmers Cooperative

Kate LaTour, Government Relations Manager, National Cooperative Business Association

Tim O’Connell, West Region Coordinator, Rural Development Innovation Center, U.S. Department of Agriculture

Joan Connell, Field Medical Officer, North Dakota Department of Health

Rex Force, Vice President for Health Sciences, Kasiska Division of Health Sciences, Idaho State University

Krista Stadler, Senior Director of Telehealth Services, St. Luke’s Health System

Jennifer Stoll, Executive Vice President of Government Relations and Public Affairs, OCHIN

Workshop: Oregon Virtual, March 19-20, 2020

Ben Alexander, Senior Program Advisor, Resources Legacy Fund

Adam Denlinger, General Manager, Seal Rock Water District

George McGraw, Chief Executive Officer, DigDeep

David Flesher, Community Programs Specialist, Rural Utilities Service, U.S. Department of Agriculture

Ari Neumann, Director of Community and Environmental Services, Rural Community Assistance Corporation

Elsie Meeks, Board of Trustees Chair, Native American Agriculture Fund

Lisa Smith, Executive Director, Washington State Microenterprise Association

Anthony Tarnasky, Senior Vice President, Commercial Banking Team Lead, Columbia Bank

Hermina Harold, Executive Director, Trust Montana

Kristin King-Ries, Legal Counsel and Program Developer, Trust Montana

Kim Travis, Housing Integrator, Oregon Housing and Community Services

Miles Nowlin, Housing Co-Op Development Specialist, Northwest Cooperative Development Center

Natalie Spencer-Clair, Founder, APX1

Russ Elliott, Director, Washington State Broadband Office

Carrie Pipinich, Senior Project Manager, Mid-Columbia Economic Development District, Oregon

Dave Dillon, Executive Vice President, Oregon Farm Bureau

Willie Hines, Chief Operation Officer, Farmer Veteran Coalition

Christopher Mertz, Regional Director, National Agricultural Statistics Service, U.S. Department of Agriculture

Alan Sams, Reub Long Dean and Director, College of Agricultural Sciences, Oregon State University

John Giller, Director of Fire, Fuels and Aviation for Region VI, U.S. Forest Service

Cassandra Moseley, Research Professor, Institute for a Sustainable Environment, University of Oregon

Will Smith, Senior Planner, Wasco County, Oregon

WEBINARS

Chairman’s Initiative Launch, July 16, 2019

The Honorable Doug Burgum, Governor of North Dakota

Matthew Rantanen, Director of Technology, Southern California Tribal Chairmen’s Association

Joe Willauer, Executive Director, Butte Local Development Corporation

Robin Brown, Executive Director, Grand Junction Economic Partnership

Broadband Data and Mapping: Federal Action and Developments, November 15, 2019

Brent Legg, Vice President of Government Affairs, Connected Nation

Kirk Burgee, Chief of Staff, Wireline Competition Bureau, Federal Communications Commission

Jerry Leverich, Senior Council, U.S. House Committee on Energy and Commerce

John Lin, Professional Staff, U.S. Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation

Tim Moyer, Program Manager, National Telecommunications and Information Administration, U.S. Department of Commerce

Broadband Deployment in Tribal Communities, November 21, 2019

Matthew Rantanen, Director of Technology, Southern California Tribal Chairmen’s Association

Paul Hill, from Utah State University, makes a point during a roundtable discussion about the future of remote work during an Initiative workshop.
We would also like to thank all of the groups and organizations that participated in workshops, webinars, initiative surveys, meetings, and the advisory committee over the past year:

Alliance for Rural Impact  
Alpine County, California  
America’s Small Business Development Center Network  
American Farm Bureau Federation  
American Fuel and Petrochemical Manufacturers  
American Indian Alaska Native Tourism Association  
American Sheep Industry Association  
American Wind Energy Association  
AMERIND Risk  
Anadarko  
ANB Bank  
Ann Walker Consulting  
Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield  
APX1  
Arizona Center for Rural Health  
Arizona Rural Health Association  
Arizona Rural Transportation Advocacy Council  
Arizona State University  
Ash Grove Cement Company  
Association of Public and Land-grant Universities  
Association of Washington Business  
AT&T  
Backcountry Hunters and Anglers  
Beacon Health Options  
Biotechnology Innovation Organization  
Black Hills Energy  
Blaine County, Idaho  
Blue Cross of Idaho Foundation  
BNSF Railway  
Boettcher Foundation  
Boone and Crockett Club  
Boulder Valley School District, Colorado  
Bushel  
Butte Local Development Corporation  
CalNet  
California Center for Cooperative Development  
Center for Rural Health  
Central Oregon Intergovernmental Council  
Chaffee County, Colorado  
Citizens for Responsible Energy Solutions  
Citizens’ Institute on Rural Design  
City of Lander, Wyoming  
City of Moab, Utah  
City of Prescott, Arizona,  
City of Show Low, Arizona  
Colorado Business Roundtable  
Colorado Cattlemen’s Agricultural Land Trust  
Colorado Counties  
Colorado Creative Industries  
Colorado State University  
• Colorado State University Extension  
Columbia Bank  
Columbia Gorge Community College  
Connected Nation  
Cooperative Development Services  
Copa Di Vino and Pulpoloco Sangria  
Council for Affordable and Rural Housing  
Council of State Community Development Agencies  
Council of State Vocational Rehabilitation Administrators  
Daggett County, Utah  
Dakota Carrier Network  
Dakota Prairie Regional Center for the Arts  
Delta Montrose Electric Association  
Democracy at Work Institute  
DigDeep  
Diné Food Sovereignty Alliance  
Eastern Plains Council of Governments  
Eastern Washington University  
Edison Electric Institute  
Education Commission of the States  
Education Networks of America  
El Pomar Foundation  
Emerging Prairie  
Emery County, Utah  
Energy Fairness  
Energy Foundation  
Energy Trust of Oregon  
Environmental Defense Fund  
Farm Credit Council  
Farm to Table New Mexico  
Farmer Veteran Coalition  
FatBeam  
Federal Communications Commission  
First Nations Development Institute  
Forest Stewards Development Institute  
Four Corners Economic Development  
Freeport-McMoRan  
Fremont County, Wyoming  
Global MindEd  
Global Pathways Institute  
Grand Junction Economic Partnership  
Grow with Google  
Hampton Inns  
HDR  
Heart of the Rockies Initiative  
Heritage Inspirations  
Idaho Farm Bureau Federation  
Idaho Forest Group  
Idaho National Laboratory  
Idaho Rural Health Association  
Idaho State Legislature  
Idaho State University  
• Idaho Center for Health Research  
International Selkirk Loop  
Intertribal Agriculture Council  
Klamath Community College  
LafargeHolcim  
Lake Area Technical Institute  
Lake County Community Development Corporation  
Los Alamos National Lab  
MDU Resources Group  
Maddock Opera House Association  
McKenzie County, North Dakota  
Microsoft  
Mid-Columbia Economic Development District, Oregon  
Midco  
Montana Cooperative Development Center  
Montana State University  
• Montana Office of Rural Health and Area Health Education Center  
• Montana State University Extension  
• Western Transportation Institute
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MuralNet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National Association of Counties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Association of Development Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Association of Development Organizations Research Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Association of Home Builders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Association of State Aviation Officials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Association of State Departments of Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Association of State Workforce Agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Business Aviation Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Center for Economic Gardening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Center for Frontier Communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Cooperative Business Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Digital Inclusion Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Endowment for the Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Organization of State Offices of Rural Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Renewable Energy Laboratory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Rural Electric Cooperatives Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Rural Health Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Rural Water Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Wildlife Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native American Agriculture Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Public Media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NetWork Kansas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico Community Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico Economic Development Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico MainStreet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico State University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• New Mexico State University Extension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newmont Mining Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Next Century Cities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nez Perce Tribe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Kid Hungry by Share our Strength</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Idaho Tourism Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Dakota Association of Rural Electric Cooperatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Dakota Small Business Development Centers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast Oregon Economic Development District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northwest Cooperative Development Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTCA – The Rural Broadband Association</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Nurse Family Partnership |
| NuScale Power |
| OCHIN |
| Ojo Sarco Community Center |
| Oregon Farm Bureau |
| Oregon Housing and Community Services |
| Oregon State University |
| • Oregon State University Extension |
| Pacific Northwest Economic Region |
| Pacific Northwest Farmers Cooperative |
| Pew Charitable Trusts |
| Powers Pyles Sutter & Verville |
| Powder River Basin Resource Council |
| Pro Image Sports |
| Region IV Development Association |
| Resources Legacy Fund |
| Rocky Mountain Farmers Union |
| Rocky Mountain Youth Corps |
| Rural Community Assistance Corporation |
| Rural Community Assistance Partnership |
| Rural County Representatives of California |
| Rural Development Initiatives |
| Rural LISC |
| Schools, Health and Libraries Broadband Coalition |
| Schulz Farms |
| Seal Rock Water District |
| Seven County Infrastructure Coalition |
| Shoshone Family Medical Center |
| Sky City Cultural Center and Haak’u Museum |
| Small Urban, Rural and Tribal Center on Mobility |
| SoloWorks Cibola |
| South Central Public Health District, Idaho |
| Southern California Tribal Chairmen’s Association |
| Southern Utah University |
| Sproule Farms |
| St. Luke’s Health System |
| St. Luke’s Wood River Hospital |
| Stanford University |
| • Bill Lane Center for the American West |
| State of Alaska |
| • Alaska Governor’s Council on People with Disabilities and Special Education |

| State of Arizona |
| • Office of Governor Doug Ducey |
| State of Colorado |
| • Colorado Broadband Office |
| • Colorado Department of Local Affairs |
| • Colorado Resiliency Office |
| • Office of Governor Jared Polis |
| State of Hawaii |
| • Office of Governor David Ige |
| State of Idaho |
| • Idaho Commission on the Arts |
| • Idaho Governor’s Office of Energy and Mineral Resources |
| • Office of Governor Brad Little |
| State of Montana |
| • Montana Governor’s Office of Economic Development |
| State of New Mexico |
| • Office of Governor Michelle Lujan Grisham |
| State of North Dakota |
| • North Dakota Council on the Arts |
| • North Dakota Department of Commerce |
| • North Dakota Department of Health |
| • North Dakota Department of Information Technology |
| • North Dakota Department of Transportation |
| • Office of Governor Doug Burgum |
| State of Oregon |
| • Office of Governor Kate Brown |
| State of South Dakota |
| • Office of Governor Kristi Noem |
| State of Texas |
| • Texas Governor’s Committee on People with Disabilities |
| State of Utah |
| State of Washington |
| • Washington State Broadband Office |
| Strengthen ND |
| The Aspen Institute Community Strategies Group |
| The Cooperative Way |
| The Food Depot |
| The Nature Conservancy |
| The Southwest Center for Health Innovation |
| The Western Way |
Thunder Valley Community Development Corporation
Town of Darrington, Washington
Town of Dayton, Wyoming
Town of Payson, Arizona
Town of Silt, Colorado
Tri-State Generation and Transmission Association
Trust Montana
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
U.S. Department of Agriculture
• Forest Service
• National Agricultural Statistics Service
• Rural Development
• Rural Utilities Service
U.S. Department of Commerce
• National Telecommunications and Information Administration
U.S. Department of Defense
U.S. Department of Energy
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
U.S. Department of Homeland Security
• Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency
• Federal Emergency Management Agency
U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development
U.S. Department of Labor
• State Exchange on Employment and Disability
U.S. Department of Transportation
• Federal Highway Administration
U.S. Endowment for Forestry and Communities
U.S. House Committee on Energy and Commerce
U.S. Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation
U.S. Small Business Administration
U.S. Travel Association
University of California Extension
University of Hawaii
University of Hawaii-Manoa Extension
University of Idaho
• University of Idaho Extension
University of Minnesota Extension
University of Nevada Agricultural Experiment Station
University of Oregon
• Ecosystem Workforce Program
• Institute for a Sustainable Environment
• Institute for Policy Research and Engagement
Utah Advanced Materials and Manufacturing Initiative
Utah Governor’s Office of Rural Development
Utah Office of Outdoor Recreation
Utah Office of Tourism
Utah State University
• Utah State University Extension
• Western Rural Development Center
Vantage Communications
Vitalyst Health Foundation
Vive NW
Wallowa Resources
Walton Family Foundation
Wasco County, Oregon
Washington State Microenterprise Association
Washington State University
• Washington State University Extension
Wattle and Daub Contractors
Wells Fargo
Western Association of Agricultural Experiment Station Directors
Western Energy Supply and Transmission Associates
Western Extension Directors Association
Western Governors University
Western Organization of Resource Councils
William and Flora Hewlett Foundation
Williston Downtowners Association
Wyoming Business Alliance
Wyoming Counties